



## Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758  
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711  
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

### COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

#### Meeting Notice and Agenda

April 26, 2023, 9 a.m.

This meeting was held virtually on Zoom

#### Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal  
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo  
Commissioner Cynthia Choi  
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky  
Commissioner Cece Feiler  
Commissioner Brian Levin  
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar

#### Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director  
Alec Watts, CRD Assistant Deputy Director  
Gregory Mann, CRD Attorney IV

#### Others Present

Abby Browning, Ex-officio Commission member, Governor's Office in Emergency Services  
An estimated 2 members of the public participated virtually.

#### I. Welcome

##### A. Call to Order

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

##### B. Establishment of a Quorum

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts who conducted roll call.

##### C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal Reviewed the public comment process.

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda for the meeting and noted that agenda item III would be removed and that the Commission would proceed to agenda item IV immediately following agenda item I.

**III. Civil Rights Department Report**

\*Please note agenda item III was removed during the Review of the Agenda\*

**IV. Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Annual Report**

Chair Roybal let everyone know the Commission's annual report is due on July 1, 2023. They encouraged Commissioners to discuss the Commission's Annual Report in their respective subcommittee meetings. Chair Roybal reviewed the outline of the report and highlighted the report's main goals: (1) Provide a comprehensive accounting of hate activity in California, (2) Develop recommendations for reducing hate crimes, and (3) Develop recommendations for enhancing resources and support available for people and communities.

**Commissioner Discussion**

Commissioner Choi proposed including California's demographics, such as percentage of those who are immigrants and English proficiency, to address possible gaps regarding policies, resources, and information.

Commissioner Feiler thanked everyone for their work on the report.

Commissioner Damsky recommended the inclusion of monitoring online extremism and hate.

Commissioner Sinnar proposed including ways in which hate incidents are brought into the scope of the Commission's work, as well as the reasons to why the Commission was formed and is focusing on incidents of hate.

- Chair Roybal responded to this and announced that California vs. Hate is a non-law enforcement mechanisms for reporting on, and tracking hate data collection.

Commissioner Levin suggested clarifying the focus on targeted violence and its different manifestations, as well as extending civil liberties even to those who the Commission may not agree with, and referencing the latest available data.

- Chair Roybal noted that data collection is not standardized, and it's important to access as much data as possible to get an accurate picture of what is happening.

Vice Chair Salcedo emphasized how additional violence translates to interpersonal violence and hate. She suggested including the importance of storytelling and community-led media collaborations to change people's minds.

- Chair Roybal thanked Vice Chair Salcedo for highlighting the boldness of some of the groups that perpetuate hate.
- Commissioner Sinnar added context on institutional and state violence, noting that it's often interrelated with interpersonal violence. She mentioned other Commissions that were created to address these issues.
- Commissioner Levin agreed with Vice Chair Salcedo and stated that increased hate against particular groups has made hate more resilient. He also mentioned different manifestations of prejudice.
- Vice Chair Salcedo highlighted the influx of people from the trans community moving to California due to increased anti-trans rhetoric in other states. She emphasized California still had work to do and the need for everyone to have information to prepare for and address these issues.
- Chair Roybal responded that the report will address these issues and will set up future reports to fill gaps as more data is collected.
- Commissioner Damsky said the report should mention the difficulty in differentiating between the First Amendment, freedom of speech, hate speech, and what the Commission can do about that.

#### Public Comment

Greg DeGiere asked the Commission to address hate crimes against people with disabilities. He mentioned that law enforcement reports less than half 1 percent of hate crimes against people with disabilities and wanted the Commission to make recommendations to the legislature and oppose AB 32.

#### Action by the Commission

The Commission took no action with regard to the report.

Chair Roybal announced that the review of the final report will take place at the next Commission meeting and will be provided in advance. They also reminded everyone to discuss in their subcommittee meetings and provide feedback to staff if anything comes up.

## **II. Approval of the Minutes**

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the March meeting and asked for edits, amendments, and public comments on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

#### Public Comment

Greg DeGiere saw there was an incorrect reference to a bill he is supporting and wanted to make the correction to AB 449.

#### Action by the Commission

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes with the amendment. Commissioner Damsky seconded. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the amended minutes.

**V. Updates from Chair and Subcommittees**

**A. Chair**

Chair Roybal made the following announcements:

- The next Commission meeting is on May 24th and Chair Roybal hopes the final version of annual report will be approved then.
- Introduced the new Civil Rights Department's staff Monica Chavez.
- The first Community Forum will take place on May 24th at 11:30 a.m. following the next Commission meeting. During the forum, Commissioner Levin and Stop AAPI Hate will present on the state of hate in California. CRD staff will also discuss resources available for individuals and communities impacted by hate. Following the presentations, the Commission will open up the floor to public input.
- The launch of the California vs. Hate Resource Line Press Conferences will take place on the morning of May 4th in Sacramento.
- Commissioners Sinnar and Levin published research articles in the Journal of Crime and Criminology.

**B. Subcommittee on Research and Data**

Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Sinnar

Commissioner Levin gave following updates:

- The subcommittee is identifying areas that require research and are working to establish timelines in which that will be completed.
- The subcommittee will be collaborating with other entities that possess research or data in these areas.
- Commissioner Levin Shared a link to the research articles published by him and Commissioner Sinnar in the chat:  
<https://scholarlycommons.law.northwestern.edu/jclc/vol112/iss4/>
- Commissioner Sinnar made the following remarks:
- Described the progress the subcommittee is making with their research, and invited anyone who has information areas that require more study to share that with staff to assist the subcommittee in prioritizing their efforts.

**C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations**

Commissioner Choi

Commissioner Choi provided the following updates:

- The subcommittee's collaboration with organizations that are working to respond to hate incidents in California and across the nation. She discussed how the subcommittee is approaching its Policy and Best Practices review on two levels: (1) Rapid response, which focuses on identifying government agencies that have a specific role in coordinating efforts, and (2) prevention, which focuses on looking towards community-based organizations because they are more trusted by the affected communities.
- She encouraged fellow Commissioners to share information about the communities and organizations they work with, that are engaging in policy and best practices to reduce redundancies.
- Emphasized the importance of working with community-led organizations to help analyze the root causes of the issues affected communities face.

#### **D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement**

Commissioner Damsky

Commissioner Damsky provided updates from Commissioner Southers, who was not present at the meeting:

- The Annual Commission Report needed to include a strategic plan and that the subcommittee discussed connecting with UASI, various grant programs for law enforcement education and awareness efforts, and with other organizations and funding tackling hate incidents and misinformation with evidence-based strategies.
- The subcommittee was exploring a new website called Moonshot, which helps protect people online. She added that the subcommittee was considering alternative reporting options for citizens who view law enforcement as a threat.

#### **Commission Discussion**

Commissioner Levin inquired for more information on UASI.

- Commissioner Damsky responded that Commissioner Southers was more familiar with UASI as she recently found out about them in their meeting.
- Abby Browning explained that the funds UASI receives come from Homeland Security. She continued to explain UASI's structure and how the Specialized Training Institute goes through them, but noted the problem is that they are focused on the urban areas while hate crimes are prevalent everywhere.

#### **E. Subcommittee on Community Forums**

Commissioner Feiler

Commissioner Feiler shared the following update:

The Commission's first Public Forum on May 24th at 11:30 a.m. and that the subcommittee had their first listening session that helped them prepare for the Forum.

#### **F. Subcommittee on Funding**

## **VI. Commissioner Announcements**

- Commissioner Feiler brought up her Summit at UCLA on mental health with Oprah as their interviewer.
- Vice Chair Salcedo announced California vs. Hate Press Conference on May 4<sup>th</sup> in Sacramento and that her organization purchased property in Los Angeles for a multi-service space.
- Commissioner Levin announced he will be leaving the university to focus more on public policy and will be giving a farewell address on May 11<sup>th</sup> on campus, he will be showcasing some research. He then delivered a speech about the significance of the work the Commission is doing.
- Commissioner Choi shared there will be events for the Stop AAPI Hate's presentation on May 9th and May 10th, which will include their research.
- Commissioner Feiler encouraged Commissioners to spread the word about the upcoming public forum.

## **VII. Public Comment on Items not on the Agenda**

Greg DeGiere made several requests that the subcommittee meetings be open or at least allow for public comments on the discussions being had, suggested Commission establish a process for appointing non-member advisors to the subcommittees, and wants the Commission to review upcoming bills and laws in the legislature. He also flagged that Zoom requests an email when signing in and hoped that can be changed. Finally, he wished to share resources with the Commission he believes would be helpful.

- Chair Roybal responded by providing the Commission's email, [CSH@calcivilrights.ca.gov](mailto:CSH@calcivilrights.ca.gov), so those resources can be sent.

## **VIII. Future Agenda Items**

## **IX. Adjournment**

Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 10:32 a.m.