



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

March 22, 2023, 9:00am

Remote Meeting

Members of the public joined with the below information:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87643555181>

and/or 1-699-444-9171 and Meeting ID 876 4355 5181

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Cynthia Choi
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director

Others Present

An estimated 53 members of the public participated virtually.

I. Welcome

Chair Roybal

Chair Roybal welcomed guests and fellow Commissioners to the meeting and called the meeting to order at 12:32 p.m. and then turned the meeting over to CRD Deputy Director, Alec Watts who conducted roll call.

Call to Order

CRD Deputy Director Alec Watts conducted roll call. Commissioner Southers was not present.

Establishment of a Quorum

Chair Roybal established a quorum.

Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda for the meeting.

II. **Approval of the Minutes**

Chair Russell Roybal

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the February 1, 2023 meeting and asked for edits, amendments, and public comments on the minutes.

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes and Commissioner Damsky seconded. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. **Civil Rights Department Report**

Deputy Director Adam Romero

Deputy Director Romero had several department announcements:

- The Governor has appointed Rishi Khalsa to be CRD's Deputy Director of Communications.
- CRD released a request for proposals for a media and outreach campaign to reintroduce CRD with its new name and to promote civil rights.
- CRD will be releasing data on non-binary workers from the 2020 submitted pay data report.
- Civil Rights Council has initiated a regulatory process under Government Code 11135.
- CRD is investing in research on discrimination and hate violence.

IV. **Informational Presentation and Discussion: Hate Crime Trends: A Changing Threat and Invisible Records**

Commissioner Brian Levin

Commissioner Levin gave a presentation to the Commission on data and research, collection methods, limitations, trends, and data uses regarding hate crimes.

- Commissioner Feiler asked if there was any specific data in relation to homeless populations and violent attacks and Commissioner Levin responded by stating homeless populations need to be included.
- Commissioner Choi noted the Commission should look at all data sets available, highlighted the importance of composite data, discussed the issue of misclassification, and encouraged comprehensive analysis.
- Commissioner Sinnar announced they've been invited to join research sessions put out by the UCLA Center on hate and the next one involves discussion around homeless populations and highlighted the growing amount of research around the connection between political speech and targeted rhetoric.
- Commissioner Salcedo noted she would like the Commission to think about the Trans community when thinking about this topic, especially in regard to underreporting.
- Commissioner Feiler asked if there was data or reports regarding hate incidents and crimes in prison systems, and also why were Los Angeles and New York neglected in the FBI report.

Public Comment:

Greg DeGiere: DeGiere asked if there was information regarding anti-disability and anti-female hate crimes.

Laurie Walker: Walker requested more information on the Commission and how they collect their data

V. **Updates from Chair and Subcommittees**

Chair Roybal and Commissioners

Chair Roybal:

- Chair Roybal and Vice Chair Salcedo met with staff in Los Angeles to create a plan for the Commission.

- Attended the Stop the Hate convening and gave a presentation on the Commission
- Met with members of the Civil Rights Council along with Vice Chair Salcedo.

Subcommittee on Data and Research:

Commissioner Sinnar

- Exploring research partnerships and different models of research to provide high quality information.
- Discussing additional questions to be asked on the CA Health Interview survey to gather more information regarding hate crime prevalence.
- Discussed gaps in data and research

Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations:

Commissioner Choi

- Combined the Policy Recommendations and Best Practices subcommittees
- Commissioner Choi and Commissioner Cuellar will be on the combined subcommittee.
- Established they would like to suggest using the most expansive definition of hate.
- Highlighted importance of establishing baseline data.

Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement:

Commissioner Damsky

- Subcommittee has met 3 times and have invited people into the meetings to help with the work they are trying to do.
- Met with CA Office of Emergency Services and reached out to the Chief's Association, the Sheriff's Association, and the CEO of Police Officer Standards and Training.
- Discussed current law enforcement training and potential updates and requirements for new training.
- Commissioner Choi requested a possible presentation from the subcommittee on the efficacy of hate crimes legislation.
- Commissioner Levin highlighted there is no mandatory data collection nationally, it only applies to federal agencies.
- Vice Chair Salcedo requested to explore the issue of how to capture data from communities who are highly affected by hate crimes but often don't report.
- Commissioner Sinnar suggested a presentation on law enforcement issues and brought up the issue of deterrence.
- Commissioner Cuellar suggested reaching out to the Bureau of Indian Affairs.

Subcommittee on Community Forums:

Commissioner Feiler

- Had first listening session with 12 different religious leaders.
- Want to create a public forum.

Subcommittee on Best Practices and Solutions from other Jurisdictions:

Commissioner Choi

- Subcommittee has combined with the subcommittee on Policy Recommendations.

Subcommittee on Funding:

- No updates.

Public Comment:

Greg DeGiere, Arc of California: DeGiere had several comments regarding the law enforcement subcommittee

report. He noted that there is now mandatory training beyond the police academy passed in a bill in 2021. He also referenced research regarding what influences officers to carry out their work: formal training and formal policies. DeGiere then highlighted current Assembly Bill 449, and seconded Commissioner Sinner's comments.

VI. **Discussion and Action Regarding Subcommittee Structure**

- Combined the Best Practices and Policy Recommendations subcommittees

Commissioner Feiler moved to combine the subcommittees and Vice Chair Salcedo seconded. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the motion.

VII. **Commission Member Announcements**

Commissioners

- Chair Roybal congratulated Commissioner Southers for his appointment to the Los Angeles Police Commission, and recognized Commissioner Cuellar for her feature in Comstock Magazine and Commissioners Choi and Levin for being quoted in some articles regarding the FBI's release of their hate crime statistics.
- Commissioners Choi and Levin will be presenting on a panel before the US Commission on Civil Rights.
- Commissioner Feiler noted May 4th is the mental health summit at UCLA.
- Vice Chair Salcedo announce March 31st is Trans Day of Visibility, and her organization was able to purchase land and will be building a new center.
- Commissioner Damsky noted that the Anti-Defamation League will be presenting their report findings in their antisemitism audit.
- Commissioner Levin may be appearing on MSNBC

VIII. **Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda**

Greg DeGiere: DeGiere requested information regarding the process of becoming a non-member advisor for the Commission.

IX. **Future Agenda Items**

- Community Forums Subcommittee would like to hold a public forum in conjunction with the next meeting.
- Discuss the strategic plan.

X. **Adjournment**

Chair Roybal

Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 11:52am.

