



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Minutes

October 25, 2023, 9:00 am PST

The Commission on the State of Hate conducted its meeting via teleconference.

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Cuellar
Commissioner Damsky
Commissioner Feiler
Commissioner Levin
Commissioner Sinnar

Ex-Officio Members Present

Abby Browning, Governor's Office of Emergency Services

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Assistant Deputy Director
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU
Taylor Whitely, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Rebecca Goodsell, Research Data Specialist

Others Present

An estimated 30 members of the public participated virtually.

- I. Welcome
 - A. Call to Order

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the eighth meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate and shared that translated closed captioning is available for this meeting.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda and noted that agenda item II will be moved to after agenda item III.

Chair Roybal made a statement sharing support for those who are experiencing hate as a result of the conflict in the middle east.

Chair Roybal shared the public comment process.

III. Informational Presentation and Discussion: Social Media Update & Applying Data to Protect Communities in Time of International Conflict
Commissioner Brian Levin

Commissioner Levin's presentation consisted of the following:

- A moment to highlight the importance of supporting communities impacted by global events and encouraging individuals to reach out CA vs. Hate.
- Statements about current incidents and a review of data on religious hate crimes.
- A review of 2020-2022 FBI Reported US Hate Crime data and a discussion of underreporting for certain communities.
- A review of the number of reported hate incidents from October 7th to October 22 compared to the same time frame from 2022.
- An explanation of the patterns of the past and rises in hate crimes.
- Mention of lawsuits that the attorney general is taking on against Elon Musk and Meta.

Commissioner Levin ended his presentation with a statement of peace.

Chair Roybal thanked Commissioner Levin for his presentation and invited Gregory Mann to provide a quick announcement.

Gregory Mann shared information regarding the upcoming community forums on November 9th in Los Angeles and December 8th in San Diego.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Levin shared some information about ING, a community organization, and the educational resources they offer.

Commissioner Feiler shared some reports she has received of incidents of antisemitism. She discussed the suffering of the Jewish community.

Commissioner Sinnar shared the safety concerns she has received from Palestinian, Israeli, Jewish, and Muslim communities. She mentioned recent incidents of hate against Palestinian and Muslim community members, and safety measures being taken as a result. She discussed people losing jobs for their support of Palestine.

Vice Chair Salcedo led a moment of deep breathing to send out healing energy. She also asked about the calls to action that can be taken.

Commissioner Damsky shared her gratitude for the presentation provided by Commissioner Levin and those who are participating in this conversation.

Public Comment

Associate Governmental Program Analyst Monica Chavez read the written public comments.

One commentor shared:

- Their experience with the lack of the acknowledgement by the media and political leaders of the effected Palestinians and those who support them.
- One of the policy recommendations the Commission should consider is to urge officials and departments to convene with community organizations to listen to their hate- related experiences and to get their reporting numbers, as these organizations are where community members are turning to for reporting.

Another commentor shared some reports of hate-based incidents across California against Muslims. They emphasized the importance of educating and uplifting Palestinians, Muslims, and those perceived as Muslim.

Becky Monroe shared that CA vs. Hate is not connected to law enforcement, that they are directly working with NGOs across the state, and are they are working on building trust with those organizations.

Commissioner Levin recognized the impact made by an organizing member of ING and thanked her for being in the meeting.

The Commission took a break at 10:12 am and reconvened at 10:20 am.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes.

Action by the Commission

Commission Levin moved to approve the minutes; seconded by Commissioner Feiler.

The minutes were approved:

- Ayes: 6
- Nos: 0
- Abstain: 1

IV. Civil Rights Department Report

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts provided four updates from the Civil Rights Department.

Alec Watts shared that Chair Roybal received the 2023 Latino Leaders of Influence Award.

Commissioner Levin congratulated Chair Roybal and asked to get more informational about the award

V. Chair and Subcommittees Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Updates provided by Chair Roybal:

- There have been discussions with the Chair of the Civil Rights Council to collaborate in the upcoming year.
- Highlighted some moments of celebration since the last meeting.
- Congratulated Vice Chair Salcedo for being honored by the Mexican American Legal Defense and Education Fund (MALDEF).
- Congratulated Commissioner Choi who presented at the Change Philanthropy Conference and Commissioners Levin and Southers who presented at the Eradicate Hate Global Summit.

Started a discussion on the date and time of Commission meetings for the new year.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates by Commissioner Sinnar:

The Subcommittee and Civil Rights Department staff have been working on community focused data rather than law enforcement data.

Rebecca Goodsell, Research Data Specialist, has set up meetings between the Subcommittee with subject matter experts to discuss possible research contracts to help guide policy recommendations.

The Subcommittee has multiple projects they are currently funding and provided general overview of what those projects are focusing on.

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations

Updates by Commissioner Cuellar:

The Subcommittee has changed the time of their regular meetings and brought on a new researcher.

One of the main focuses of the Subcommittee is in language access and responses to hate and prevention. The Subcommittee is having meetings to identify state agencies that work to address these issues.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal shared their excitement around the language justice pilot. They want the subcommittee to come up with a process for vetting and adding non-member advisors to Subcommittees.

Commissioner Levin said he has community leaders he could put the subcommittee in contact with. He emphasized the importance of having members from underrepresented communities at these Commission meetings.

Commissioner Roybal asked Assistant Deputy Director Watts to go over the protocol for Commissioners to have representative during Commission meetings.

Commissioner Feiler wanted to confirm there will be some kind of screening process.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Updates by Commissioner Damsky:

The Subcommittee has discussed AB 449, which would require reporting of hate crimes from law enforcement agencies. Shared additional details of the bill.

The Subcommittee has been working on a 15-minute law enforcement training video with POST and that is in process next year. She shared further details of that project.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Levin shared his thoughts on the Subcommittees updates.

Chair Roybal noted that Commissioner Cuellar is also in charge of the law enforcement on her reservation.

Commissioner Damsky stated that the Subcommittee has also considered getting expertise from Commissioner Cuellar.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Updates by Commissioner Feiler:

Shared information regarding the next two community forums, as well as discussing scheduling Community forums ahead of time to ensure all Commissioners are able to attend.

Commissioner Cuellar encouraged Commissioners to share the flyer for the upcoming community forum.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal proposed that the Commission consider possibly relocating in-person meetings from urban centers to more rural areas that have not reported incidents of hate.

Commissioner Feiler agreed about entering rural areas.

Commissioner Levin discussed data desert locations in California.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This agenda item was skipped.

VI. Commission Member Announcements

Chair Roybal shared to the Commission the option subcommittees wish to collaborate, staff would be able to notice those publicly.

Commissioner Feiler announced that she has a 3-year term as Chair of the UCLA Resnick Neuropsychiatric Hospital Board of Advisors.

Vice Chair Salcedo shared her organization has received funding process of building a state of the arts center in Hollywood. She mentioned that they still need to raise money and asked Commissioners if they would like to get involved or know people who would want to be involved. She also shared her fashion show annual fundraiser.

Chair Roybal congratulated Vice Chair Salcedo.

VII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. (Government Code §§ 11125 and 11125.7 (a))

Chair Roybal read the written public comments.

Commissioner Levin responded to one of the written public comments.

VIII. Future Agenda Items

No future Agenda Items.

IX. Adjournment of the meeting

Commissioner Damsky moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice Chair Salcedo seconded the motion.

Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 11:14 am