



Civil Rights Department • Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@calcivilrights.ca.gov

Annotated Agenda: December 8, 2023

Meeting: 10:00 am PT

Joan B. Kroc Institute for Peace and Justice, University of San Diego
1st Floor: Room D
5998 Alcalá Park
San Diego, CA 92110

The Commission on the State of Hate conducted its meeting and community forum at the address above and via teleconference.

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Choi
Commissioner Cuellar
Commissioner Damsky
Commissioner Feiler
Commissioner Levin
Commissioner Sinnar
Commissioner Southers

Ex-Officio Members Present

Abby Browning, Governor's Office of Emergency Services

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, Deputy Director
Rishi Khalsa, Deputy Director of Communications
Alec Watts, Assistant Deputy Director
Marquez Equalibria, Assistant Deputy Director
Alex Hernandez, Information Officer
Gregory Mann, CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CCRU
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Rebecca Goodsell, Research Data Specialist

Others Present

An estimated 25 members of the public participated virtually.
One member of the public participated in-person.

I. Welcome

A. Call to Order

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the ninth meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate. They shared that translated closed captioning is available for this meeting.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Commissioner Cuellar provided a land acknowledgment.

Chair Roybal gave a reminder of the CA vs. Hate Resource Line and announced that the Commission's fourth community forum will take place after the meeting.

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda and the public comment process.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Action by the Commission

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes; seconded by Commissioner Damsky.

The minutes were approved:

- Ayes: 7
- Nos: 0
- Abstain: 2

III. Civil Rights Department Report

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts provided updates from the Civil Rights Department.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Levin asked about data on hate crimes.

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts responded.

IV. Proposal Regarding Meeting Schedule

Chair Roybal proposed moving the Commission meetings scheduled in February and March for the week prior to their regularly scheduled meeting dates.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Damsky noted she has a conflict on both of those dates.

Chair Roybal suggested figuring out scheduling via email.

V. Chair and Subcommittees Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Updates provided by the Chair:

- The Commission has received edits from the Governor’s Office on the Commission Report, and it should be released soon.
- Last month the Commission recognized Sikh Awareness and Appreciation Month, Native American Heritage Month, and the Transgender Day of Remembrance. The Commission and CA vs. Hate also took part in United Against Hate Week.
- Congratulated Commissioner Cuellar, who was interviewed by CA vs. Hate for her leadership combatting hate and advocating for the rights of Native Americans.
- In the January meeting, the Commission will hold elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates provided by Commissioner Sinnar:

- The Subcommittee has been designing a survey with the California Health Interview Survey with the goal of getting a detailed account of hate in California as well as the unmet needs of those experiencing and witnessing incidents hate.
- There are ongoing projects with the UCLA Initiative for the Study of Hate, including a research convening with UCLA scholars to connect research with policymakers.
- The subcommittee is reviewing literature on public messaging interventions related to hate.
- There are explorations of research contracts on topics such as online hate and sentencing policies.
- Expressed gratitude for the work of Rebecca Goodsell, Assistant Deputy Director Watts, and Commissioner Levin.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Choi asked if the convening with UCLA will be open.

- Commissioner Sinnar responded the Subcommittee is still scoping it.

Commissioner Levin discussed an incident relating to research on online hate.

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations

Updates provided by Commissioner Choi:

- The Subcommittee's consultant research priorities are on victims' needs, language access, community-based organization (CBO) actions, and state agencies' outreach.
- Recommended deferring taking a position on pending legislation until the Commission establishes clear policy recommendations and priorities are established. She also discussed staffing needs and expertise required to take a position. Considered revisiting the topic later.

Updates provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

- The subcommittee discussed the non-member advisor policy and pointed to the necessity for input from Commission members. She initiated a discussion on the matter.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal suggested having a conversation with Greg DeGiere about the nonmember policy.

Commissioner Southers knows of several people who would be interested in assisting the Commission as advisors.

Commissioner Sinnar asked about the CBO research being conducted.

- Commissioner Choi responded that the Subcommittee is looking at CBOs that are supporting victims and preventing hate.
- Commissioner Sinnar asked for a follow-up clarifying if the rapid responses are relating to individual needs or broader community needs.
 - Commissioner Choi responded that they were initially focused on rapid response but also have interests in broader community needs, such as prevention, collaboration with state agencies, and potential barriers to connecting victims with resources.

Vice Chair Salcedo offered her CBO as one to reach out to for help.

- Commissioner Choi responded that her organization is on the Subcommittee's list.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Updates provided by Commissioner Damsky:

- AB 449 was signed into law on October 8th

- The Subcommittee is creating a 15-minute training video with POST on the supplemental hate crime report as mandated by AB 449. The project will include collaborations with subject matter experts, with work sessions scheduled between February 28 and March 1, 2024.
- The commission will present a draft outline of the POST training in its next meeting in January.
- The second phase, scheduled for April 9 to May 2, 2024, will culminate in filming the training video.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Updates provided by Commissioner Feiler:

- Expressed gratitude to CRD staff for their work on the previous community forums and provided an overview of the topics and groups that presented.
 - Commissioner Cuellar thanked those who were in attendance and the speakers at the last forum.
- Opened a discussion for potential topics and formats for the community forums next year.
 - Chair Roybal shared their thoughts on the last community forum.
- Shared incidents of antisemitism in California.
 - Chair Roybal urged those who have been a victim or witness of a hate incident to report it to CA vs. Hate.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal emphasized hosting in-person forums in rural areas and recommended the topic of violence and hate that the trans community experiences in conjunction with Trans Day of Remembrance.

- Commissioner Feiler responded that the Subcommittee is looking into hosting events in more rural areas.

Commissioner Sinnar suggested a forum on election rhetoric and how it affects hate crimes. She also discussed the recent increased hate incidents against Jewish, Muslim, Sikh, and Palestinian communities.

- Commissioner Feiler echoed the point made regarding some religious groups' fear of wearing religious symbols.

Commissioner Damsky suggested a forum on the First Amendment and protest as well as a forum on how different religious groups experience hate.

Vice Chair Salcedo emphasized the murder of members of the trans community across the

United States.

Commissioner Southers shared that houses of worship should have protocols in place to report crimes and incidents as there have been increased reports.

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts asked the Commission what their preferences are for times of day or days of the week to host the community forums.

- Chair Roybal asked if the November forum, which took place on a Thursday evening, was the most well attended.
 - Commissioner Feiler responded that attendance may be attributable to the different groups that presented.
- Commissioner Choi suggested making accommodations according to the audience.
 - Commissioner Feiler noted that the previous forum occurred in the evening so the teens could attend.
- Vice Chair Salcedo mentioned that she has connections for locations for the next forums.
- Commissioner Damsky suggested alternating between Saturdays and Sundays if community forums are held on weekends to not impact the same religious communities.

Commissioner Levin encouraged Commissioners to post about the Commission meetings and forums on their social media.

- Chair Roybal discussed developing short pieces for the Commissioners to repost on their social media.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This agenda item was skipped.

Public Comment

A public commenter asked Commissioner Damsky to get in contact for the POST training.

VI. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Choi discussed the increased numbers of anti-Chinese immigration hate incidents.

- Chair Roybal offered connecting her with their connections with organizations in San Diego.

Commissioner Damsky shared that she announced the community forum and CA vs. Hate at an antisemitism event she attended.

Commissioner Levin discussed increased number of hate incidents against the Muslim and Jewish communities since October 2023 compared to 2022.

VII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

No public comments on items not on the agenda.

VIII. Future Agenda Items

No future agenda items.

IX. Adjournment of the meeting

Commissioner Damsky moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Levin seconded the motion. Meeting adjourned at 11:32 am.