



Civil Rights Department • Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | CSH@calcivilrights.ca.gov

Minutes

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

May 22, 2024, 9:00 am PT

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/82497406955>

and/or

1-669-444-9171 and Meeting ID: 824 9740 6955

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal

Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo

Commissioner Cynthia Choi

Commissioner Regina Cuellar

Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky

Commissioner Cece Feiler

Commissioner Brian Levin

Commissioner Shirin Sinnar

Commissioner Erroll Southers

Civil Rights Department (CRD) Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Executive Director

Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst

Rebecca Goodsell, Research Data Specialist

Kevin Thomas, Research Data Specialist

Shilpa Ram, CRD Counsel

Others Present

An estimated 22 members of the public participated virtually.

I. **Welcome**

A. **Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the fifth meeting of the year for the Commission on the State of Hate. They shared the translated closed captioning available for this meeting.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

CRD Staff Monica Chavez conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal reviewed the public comment process and reviewed the agenda.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Commissioner Choi moved to approve the minutes for the January meeting; seconded by Commissioner Cuellar.

The minutes were approved:

- Ayes: 7 (Chair Roybal, Commissioner Choi, Commissioner Cuellar, Commissioner Damsky, Commissioner Feiler, Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Sinnar)
- Nos: 0
- Abstain: 2 (Vice Chair Salcedo, Commissioner Southers)

III. Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Annual Report

CRD Data Research Specialist Rebecca Goodsell provided the following updates made to the Commission report:

- The description of recent community forum in Shingle Springs was added to the report.
- CRD staff edited the subsection on ethnic studies
- Revisions were made to the section titled "Hate in the Wake of October 7th."

Chair Roybal shared that the ad hoc subcommittee met and finalized language in the report.

Commissioner Discussion

Commissioner Levin requested the language be read aloud for the members of the public. Chair Roybal read the finalized language by the Ad Hoc Subcommittee and suggested the Commission move to a vote.

Commissioner Levin mentioned that there is new data on hate crimes from San Jose.

Commissioner Damsky thanked Commissioners Sinnar and Feiler for working on the Ad Hoc

Subcommittee.

Vice Chair Salcedo wanted to confirm the date the report is due to the Governor's Office.

Chair Roybal responded that the report is due by July 1st, the report has been updated to include recent information, and staff is working on final edits to submit to the Governor's Office.

Commissioner Damsky moved to approve the Commission Report; Commissioner Levin seconded.

Commissioner Choi confirmed that after the vote there will not be changes to the report.

Chair Roybal responded that the report will come back to the Commission only if there are substantive changes by the Governor's Office.

Commissioner Sinnar clarified that the report that is being voted on is what will be submitted to the Governor's Office.

Commissioner Choi expressed interest in expanding the added language regarding the Israel-Palestine conflict.

Commissioner Feiler disagreed about expanding the language.

Commissioner Damsky agreed with Commissioner Feiler and suggested this topic be addressed in another area such as a forum.

Commissioner Sinnar commented that the language should remain as is, as a process manner.

Commissioner Choi commented that included the phrase "generational grief" would communicate that this conflict pre-dates October 7, 2023.

Action by the Commission

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the report.

Ayes: 9 (Chair Roybal, Vice Chair Salcedo, Commissioner Choi, Commissioner Cuellar, Commissioner Damsky, Commissioner Feiler, Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers)

Nos: 0

IV. Chair and Subcommittees Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Updates provided by Chair Roybal:

- Wished everyone a happy Asian American and Pacific Islander Heritage Month and Jewish American Heritage Month.

Commissioner Choi mentioned the Stop AAPI Hate partnership with the Cut Fruit Collective and the launch of Spread AAPI Love campaign.

Commissioner Feiler and Commissioner Cuellar thanked Commissioner Choi for sharing about the Cut Fruit Collective.

Vice Chair Salcedo commented that celebrating different cultures should be year-round.

- May is Missing and Murdered Indigenous People Awareness Month. They thanked Commissioner Cuellar and Feiler for hosting the community forum in Shingle Springs. They shared that the recording of the forum is on the Commission website.
- Introduction of the newest researcher at CRD supporting the Commission, Dr. Kevin D. Thomas.

Dr. Kevin Thomas expressed excitement for joining CRD.

- CA vs. Hate held a press conference celebrating their one-year anniversary.

Deputy Directory Becky Monroe Spoke about CA vs Hate and some of the work that has been done.

Commissioner Levin asked for more details on the number of people helped through CA vs Hate.

Deputy Director Monroe responded that there have been over 2000 contacts made through CA vs. Hate and, in many cases, support resources were provided.

Commissioner Cuellar asked about resources to distribute.

Deputy Director Monroe said that she will be in contact. She also mentioned that CA vs. Hate will be doing a Pride events tour.

Chair Roybal reminded everyone that, if they have been a victim of an act of hate, they can report to CA vs. Hate.

- There are free services available for communities through the California Civil Rights Department's Community Conflict Resolution Unit (CCRU).

Commissioner Sinnar noted that it would be helpful for the Commission to hear about examples of work that has been done by CCRU.

Chair Roybal requested that Deputy Director Becky Monroe provide that in a future meeting.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates provided by Commissioner Sinnar:

- The Subcommittee is continuing its research on educational interventions. Also continuing work on criminal justice and victimization of trans people in California.
- They are exploring potential research regarding the criminal justice system.
- The subcommittee has had discussions about non-member advisors.
- There are plans to conduct a research convening in the fall with the Initiative to Study Hate. The Subcommittee welcomes suggestions from the Commission regarding community-based research experts to include.

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations and Best Practices in Other Jurisdictions

Updates provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

- The Subcommittee is continuing its research regarding language access and conducting interviews with Stop the Hate grantees.
- The subcommittee is learning about Senate Bill 1078.

Updates provided by Commissioner Choi:

- Suggested that Commissioners take turns hosting forums in different locations and offered to host in San Francisco.
- Shared her thoughts on attending the California Truth and Healing Council that occurred after the forum.
- Expressed interest in partnering with the Racial Equity Commission.

Commissioner Cuellar responded that Racial Equity Commissioner Hendrick expressed interest in collaborating after the forum.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Updates provided by Commissioner Damsky:

- Filming for the POST training video has concluded and is in the process of being edited.
- The Attorney General's Office of Native American Affairs has offered to provide information to the Commission about tribal and municipal law enforcement.

Updates provided by Commissioner Southers:

- Apologized for their absence within the subcommittee due to other commitments.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Updates provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

- Thanked everyone for attending the previous forum in Shingle Springs.
- The third forum will be a collaboration with the Civil Rights Council in the Fall.
- The final forum of the year will be in November, focusing on rural communities.

Updates provided by Commissioner Feiler

- Spoke about the importance of the previous forum relating to Native issues.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

No updates from the Subcommittee on Funding.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal echoed the previous point made about collaborating with the Racial Equity Commission.

Commissioner Sinnar suggested restorative justice, non-carceral interventions, and caste discrimination as potential topics for future forums.

Commissioner Feiler responded that continued discussions on restorative justice would be helpful to the subcommittee as they plan ongoing forums.

Chair Roybal suggested compiling resources or organizations and continuing discussions for forums in 2025 in future Commission meetings to allow more collaboration among Commissioners.

Commissioner Levin suggested the following future forum topics: violence and hate against the homeless and undocumented populations as well as the importance of balancing civil liberties and free speech.

Commissioner Damsky suggested a forum discussing hate against people with disabilities.

Chair Roybal shared that they discussed the lack of research on hate against disabled, native, and undocumented communities at the CA vs. Hate press conference. They suggested having discussions on different topics during Commission meetings and not just during community forums.

Commissioner Damsky commented on the overlap between indigenous and undocumented communities.

Public Comment

One commenter emphasized that the Commission focus on disabilities as intersectional. They shared information from the National Institute of Minority Health and Disparities regarding

lifespans, policies, and barriers to comprehensive care for disabled communities and how that is an act of Hate.

V. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Feiler announced there will be a presentation on the State of Hate in UCLA on June 10th.

Commissioner Levin shared concerns about conversations at the federal level regarding deportation. He announced that he will be presenting data in Washington, D.C. and Indiana.

Vice Chair Salcedo invited everyone to Trans Latina’s Quinceañera celebration.

Commissioner Damsky shared that she has been invited to speak with different groups about the Commission after discussions with Chair Roybal.

Chair Roybal reminded Commissioners to check in if they will be speaking at an event or to press on the behalf of the Commission in case they need materials or other information.

VI. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting.

This commenter shared that the Department of Mental Health has provided services to a quarter of a million disabled residents in LA County. They also invited Commissioners to events put on by the Los Angeles Commission on Disabilities.

Another commenter commented on the CA vs. Hate one year anniversary and thanked the Commissioners for uplifting underrepresented groups.

VII. Future Agenda Items

Reminded everyone to reach out to CA vs. Hate if they have experienced hate.

VIII. Adjournment of the Meeting

Vice Chair Salcedo moved to adjourn; Commissioner Damsky seconded. Meeting adjourned at 10:41am.