



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

651 Bannon Street, Suite 200 | Sacramento | CA | 95811
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | CSH@calcivilrights.ca.gov

Minutes

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

July 24, 2024, 9:00 am

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84654448178>

or

1-669-444-9171 and Webinar ID: 846 5444 8178

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Commissioner Cynthia Choi
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll Southers

Maria Roman-Taylorson, on behalf of Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo

Civil Rights Department (CRD) Staff Present

Alec Watts, Assistant Deputy Director
Rashida Harmon, Assistant Deputy Director
Rebecca Goodsell, Research Data Specialist
Kevin Thomas, Research Data Specialist
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Gregory Mann, CRD Counsel
Shilpa Ram, CRD Counsel
Alexandria Sadler, CRD Counsel

Others Present

An estimated 43 members of the public attended virtually.

I. Welcome

A. Call to Order

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:00 am.

They welcomed everyone to the sixth meeting of the year for the California Commission on the State of Hate. They shared that translated closed captioning is available for the meeting.

Chair Roybal introduced and welcomed Maria Roman-Taylorson, who will be serving as the representative for Vice Chair Salcedo while she is on a 3-month sabbatical.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts conducted the roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal reviewed the public comment process and the agenda.

Links Sent in the Chat:

https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/32/2024/07/CSH-Meeting_7.24.2024_NoticeAgenda.pdf

CSH@CalCivilRights.ca.gov

II. Approval of the Minutes

Link Sent in the Chat:

https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/32/2024/07/AttachmentA_CSH-Forum_5.11.2024_Minutes.pdf

Commissioner Cuellar noted a spelling error on the minutes for the May 11, 2024, community forum.

Commissioner Damsky moved to approve the May 11, 2024, community forum minutes with the correction of the spelling error; Commissioner Southers seconded.

- Ayes: 8 (Chair Roybal, Commissioner Choi, Commissioner Cuellar, Commissioner Damsky, Commissioner Feiler, Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers)
- Nays: 0

Link Sent in the Chat:

https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/32/2024/07/AttachmentB_CSH-Meeting_5.22.2024_Minutes.pdf

Commissioner Cuellar moved to approve the May 22, 2024, meeting minutes; Commissioner Damsky seconded.

- Ayes: 8 (Chair Roybal, Commissioner Choi, Commissioner Cuellar, Commissioner Damsky, Commissioner Feiler, Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers)
- Nays: 0

III. Civil Rights Department Report

Assistant Deputy Director Alec Watts shared the following information in his report:

- CRD issued its 2022 Annual Report, which included the following information:
 - The department settled 656 civil rights lawsuits in 2022.
 - The Outreach and Education Unit hosted around 200 presentations and published 6 new guides and fact sheets.
- Data from the first year since the launch of CA vs Hate.
- CRD has a new Assistant Deputy Director of Outreach and Education, Rashida Harmon.

Assistant Deputy Director Rashida Harmon presented the following information:

- CRD's Outreach and Education Unit has released new factsheets on discrimination at public businesses, workplace retaliation, and reasonable modifications in housing.
- The sexual harassment prevention guide and some housing resources have been updated.
- There are monthly webinars on Fair Employment 101 and Fair Housing 101.
- There are new webinars focusing on rights for people with disabilities, starting with fair housing.
- Overview of the "Welcome In" program.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Feiler asked about workplace harassment when it happens after work hours.

Assistant Deputy Director Harmon responded that the answer depends on the specific situation.

Commissioner Choi shared her gratitude for the work that the Outreach and Education Unit is doing.

Commissioner Sinnar asked how the Welcome In program will be evaluated.

Assistant Deputy Director Harmon responded that there are still discussions about how the program will be evaluated.

Research Data Specialist Kevin Thomas added that two evaluation measures include how prepared businesses feel to handle an incident of discrimination before and after it occurs.

Commissioner Levin asked if there are different approaches for different types of businesses.

Assistant Deputy Director Harmon answered that she would discuss with the team further before responding to that question.

Public Comment

The first commenter asked about the statistical data or reports about discrimination or hate crimes against people with disabilities.

Assistant Deputy Director Harmon responded that CA vs Hate collects that data.

Assistant Deputy Director Watts responded that CRD's annual report discusses data on disability-related complaints.

The second commenter asked for a link to the report and about any plans to help with local councils and associations regarding issues being brought up.

Assistant Deputy Director Watts responded that he was referring to the CRD report and would put a link to the CA vs Hate data release in the Zoom chat. The following links were provided in the Zoom chat:

- <https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/32/2024/06/CRD-2022-Annual-Report.pdf>
- <https://www.cavshate.org/news/one-year-anniversary>

Assistant Deputy Director Harmon responded that there is nothing in the works with regard to local councils.

IV. Chair and Subcommittees Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Updates provided by Chair Roybal:

- Wished everyone a happy Disability Pride Month.
- June was Pride Month, and CA vs Hate held a Pride tour across the state. They also shared a personal story about reporting to CA vs Hate.
- Commissioner Feiler thanked Chair Roybal for sharing the story.
- There are free services available for communities through the California Civil Rights Department's Community Conflict Resolution Unit (CCRU).
- The DOJ released its 2023 California Hate Crimes Report last month.
- United Against Hate Week will take place between 9/21 - 9/27, 2024.

Links Sent in the Chat:

<https://www.cavshate.org/>

CCRU@calcivilrights.ca.gov

<https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/community-conflict-resolution-unit/>

https://data-openjustice.doj.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2024-06/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202023f_0.pdf

<https://www.unitedagainsthateweek.org>

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Update provided by Commissioner Sinnar:

- The contract with CHIS has been extended through 2025.
- The UCLA Initiative to Study Hate is doing a literature review on bystander intervention training about hate. There are plans to hold a convening to discuss interventions and prevention related to hate in schools and online.
- There are plans to start a literature review and original research study related to online hate.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioner Southers asked if the bystander intervention training was connected to the law enforcement training done by LAPD.

Commissioner Sinnar responded that the research is a synthesis of existing research.

Commissioner Southers shared more details about the LAPD training.

Commissioner Sinnar announced that she will be stepping down from the Commission at the end of August.

Chair Roybal thanked Commissioner Sinnar and congratulated her on her upcoming fellowship.

Commissioner Levin thanked Commissioner Sinnar for her work on the Commission.

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations and Best Practices in Other Jurisdictions

Update provided by Commissioner Choi:

- A project on community-based organizations is finishing at the end of August.
- The subcommittee is beginning to look at tools, practices, and resources for best practices to reduce hate.
- Mentioned hate against public officials and Project 2025.
- There are discussions about making policy recommendations.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal suggested the subcommittee investigate what resources CA vs Hate, CRD, or the State have for election workers who are targeted.

Commissioner Damsky raised concerns about how the Commission could address issues of misinformation and journalistic integrity while also taking the First Amendment into account.

Commissioner Choi responded by providing an example of holding journalists/media outlets accountable for misinformation.

Commissioner Levin discussed fake newspapers overseas that are meant to divide people.

Commissioner Sinnar asked about the CBO research and how to make the policy recommendations in the report more accessible to lawmakers.

Research Data Specialist Rebecca Goodsell responded that once the CBO memo is complete, the consultant might present it to the Commission.

Chair Roybal suggested postponing the discussion about policy recommendations until the next subcommittee meeting and asked when the memo would be ready.

Research Data Specialist Rebecca Goodsell responded that the memo might be ready at the end of August, but a presentation would likely not occur until September.

Commissioner Southers mentioned that he has been working with colleagues on efforts related to anticipated political violence in this election year. He noted increased anti-DEI sentiments and offered his services to the Commission in any upcoming discussions or forums.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Update provided by Commissioner Damsky:

- Vice Chair Salcedo will be joining the subcommittee and Maria Roman-Taylorson will be representing her while she is on sabbatical.
- There is no update on the status of the law enforcement training video.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Update provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

- The next community forum will be on September 26th in the evening and will be a joint forum with the Civil Rights Council.
- The fourth forum of the year will be in either November or December and will also be a joint forum with the CAPIAA Commission and the Racial Equity Commission.

Commissioner Discussion

Chair Roybal suggested the campus of the California Endowment as a potential location.

Commissioner Choi suggested Asian Health Services as an option and had suggestions for the Fresno forum.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

No updates from the Subcommittee on Funding.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal announced that CCRU is available to consult with local councils and other government bodies and can help create or find appropriate training. They also announced that CDSS has shared a list of organizations who have received grants from the Stop the Hate grant program and provide services to victims and survivors of hate.

Links Sent in the Chat:

CCRU@calcivilrights.ca.gov

<https://calcivilrights.ca.gov/community-conflict-resolution-unit/>

<https://cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/cdss-programs/civil-rights/care-funding>

Commission was on break from 10:32-10:45 am.

Public Comment

A commenter thanked the Commission for their work.

V. Informational Presentation: National Multi-City Hate Crime Trends ***Commissioner Brian Levin***

Commissioner Levin presented the following:

- Trends in reported hate crime data between 1991-2022.
- Hate crime data showed an increase during the 2016 presidential election.
- 2020 data during COVID and George Floyd protests.
- There were increased reports of hate crimes after former President Trump's executive order banning people from Muslim-majority countries from entering the U.S.
- Hate crime data from the 10 largest cities in the U.S. in 2022 and 2023.
- The data shows one small piece of what is happening as there is underreporting when it comes to hate crime data.
- During the Trump presidency, hate crime statistics hit multi-year highs in 2018 and 2020.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Damsky asked about anti-Muslim and anti-Arab hate crimes.

Commissioner Levin responded that there is underreporting, but there was still an increase in hate crimes against those groups.

Commissioner Damsky asked if there is an analysis of why some cities have higher rates of hate crimes for different groups.

Commissioner Levin responded that much of this variation in hate crimes for different groups depends on the demographics and geographic distribution of the groups living in those cities.

Commissioner Choi wanted more information on the connection between catalytic events and law enforcement data.

Commissioner Levin discussed some examples of instances where the data showed increases in reported hate activity after an event that may have prompted, or catalyzed, hate. Examples given included the racist rhetoric surrounding the COVID-19 pandemic and the social justice protests following the death of George Floyd in the summer of 2020.

Commissioner Sinnar discussed data and research related to surges in hate crimes, including those tied to outcomes of elections and voting, such as the 2016 Presidential election in the U.S. and the Brexit vote in the United Kingdom.

Commissioner Choi discussed the harm resulting from elected officials using racist language.

VI. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Damsky shared that she was in the San Diego Pride parade with Commissioner Levin and Chair Roybal. She also announced that UCSD is hosting an event that will be combating anti-Semitism and Islamophobia on September 20th.

Commissioner Cuellar announced that her community will have their cultural Big Time event from August 24-25.

Links Sent in the Chat:

https://ncrconline.com/religious-intolerance/?mc_cid=cf0be865b2&mc_eid=9e2db16422

https://ncrconline.com/religious-intolerance-form/?mc_cid=60d2e1c944&mc_eid=9e2db16422&mc_cid=cf0be865b2&mc_eid=9e2db16422

<https://laist.com/news/inland-empire-leaders-see-buffet-of-hate-as-discriminatory-attacks-and-bias-increase>

VII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting.

Commissioner Levin thanked Marshall Wong and Norma Lopez for their work on their Human Relations Commissions. He extended his sympathies to the family of Blaze Bernstein. He also talked about San Diego Pride.

Chair Roybal shared their experience as a San Diego Pride volunteer coordinator in 2017.

VIII. Future Agenda Items

IX. Adjournment of the Meeting

Commissioner Damsky moved to adjourn the meeting; Commissioner Choi seconded. The meeting adjourned at 11:29 am.